Letter of Support for Dr. Ricardo Villalba in his capacity as former Director of the Argentine Institute of Snow and Glaciers (IANIGLA) and of the National Glacier Inventory of Argentina.

On November 27, 2017, the Argentine federal judge Sebastián Casanello indicted Dr. Ricardo Villalba<sup>1</sup>, Senior Research Scientist of CONICET (National Research Council of Argentina), former Director of IANIGLA and the National Inventory of Glaciers, for the crime of "abuse of authority". This is a legal action initiated by the legal representatives of the Asamblea "Jáchal no se toca" of the city of Jáchal in the province of San Juan who alleged that the methodology implemented in the National Inventory of Glaciers was intended to favor the interests of the Barrick Gold Corporation, the largest gold mining company in the world.

The purpose of this letter is to affirm that the international scientific community expert in the many scientific disciplines in which Dr. Villalba has conducted research (including glaciology) have the utmost respect for his professional conduct, scientific integrity and scientific accomplishments. In the international scientific community, Dr. Villalba is renowned and respected for the scientific excellence of his work, his unblemished professional record, and his exceptional achievements as a mentor of early career scientists.

The Judge's indictment of Dr. Villalba asserts that cyanide spills, which resulted from the actions of the Barrick Gold Corporation that contaminated the Río Jáchal, would have been avoided if the government authority (IANIGLA) charged with the mapping and inventory of the state of glaciers and periglacial environments had completed its obligations. This assertion of responsibility and causality for the cyanide spill is not only fallacious reasoning but also is a scientifically false characterization of the quality of the mapping performed under the National Glacier Inventory. The methodology of mapping glaciers implemented in the National Glacier Inventory unquestionably met the international norms and standards for glacier mapping. The methodology applied in the National Glacier Inventory was approved by: 1) the Presidency of CONICET, 2) the Ministry of Science, Technology, and Productive Innovation, 3) the Secretariat of the Environment and Sustainable Environment, and 4) the Cabinet Chief of Ministers of the Nation of Argentina. The National Glacier Inventory and the methodologies used to derive it follow the best practices and the recommendations from the international glaciological community. These methodologies are in line with the recommendations made by Global Land Ice Measurement from Space (GLIMS), an international collaborative project that includes more than sixty institutions world-wide with the goal of creating a globally comprehensive inventory of land ice. Specifically, the application of a minimum area threshold for inclusion of glaciers is a mandatory scientific practice. The 0.01 km² (1 hectare) minimum value used in the National Glacier Inventory is smaller (i.e. a higher standard) than the one used in many others scientific studies of glaciers.

This unjust accusation against Dr. Villalba as the former Director of IANIGLA and of the National Glacier Inventory has had the effect of discrediting IANIGLA, which for forty years has been the leading national institution in the study of the environment and natural resources of the Argentine Andes. Dr. Villalba played the key role in promoting the "Law of the Glaciers" promulgated by the National Congress of Argentina in 2010 (National Law No. 26.639). During his prolific career<sup>2</sup>, Dr. Villalba has demonstrated a strong commitment to public engagement and outreach on the topic of water resources for which the Law of the Glaciers is an extraordinary milestone. Among Dr. Villalba's many other achievements and recognitions<sup>3</sup>, he is a co-recipient of the Nobel Peace Prize in 2007, which recognizes both his scientific accomplishments and sustained engagement with decision makers through his collaborative work on the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC).

One of the unfortunate inevitable consequences of this unjustified accusation against Dr. Villalba is the chilling effect it will have on future engagement of Argentine scientists with policy makers. Scientists supported by CONICET are expected to share their scientific expertise with the Argentine public in general and specifically with decision makers in the realm of natural resource protection. The National Glacier Inventory is an iconic example of a potentially highly beneficial and effective interaction between CONICET scientists and policy makers because it addresses the societally critically important issue of hydrologic resources in the context of climate change. This scientific and policy achievement is without precedent in Latin America. The National Glacier Inventory for the first time allows resource managers and planners to know the actual extent of glaciers in Argentina and how that extent is fluctuating with climate change. The false accusation against Dr. Villalba not only endangers the continuation of that long-term painstaking scientific program but it also defames the competency, honesty, and integrity of the collaborative team of researchers who implement the National Glacier Inventory as well as its sponsoring institution—CONICET.

### The following footnotes address Dr. Villalba's stature in the international scientific community:

- <sup>1</sup> Dr. Villalba is among the top climate scientists in Argentina. He is a Senior Research Scientist of CONICET (National Research Council of Argentina) at the Argentine Institute of Snow and Glaciers (IANIGLA) in Mendoza. He holds the following academic degrees: BS in Forest Engineering (Universidad Nacional de La Plata, Argentina); MS in Photo Interpretation in Forestry (CIAF, Colombia); and PhD in Geography (University of Colorado, USA). Dr. Villalba was also a Postdoctoral Research Fellow at Lamont-Doherty Earth Observatory (Columbia University, USA). This breadth of academic training is impressive by any standard.
- <sup>2</sup> Dr. Villalba is an exemplary model of an interdisciplinary, international, collaborative scientist. His distinguished research career includes publication of over 200 scientific papers in referred journals and books covering a wide range of topics across glaciology, climatology, dendrochronology, geomorphology, hydrology, ecology and water resource management. He has led numerous co-authored publications in leading international journals in glaciology, ecology, biogeography, climatology, hydrology, and the social sciences. Dr. Villalba has made over 200 scientific presentations in Argentina, USA, Canada, Brazil, Italia, Switzerland, Chile, China, Ecuador, Venezuela, Perú, Bolivia, Uruguay, Australia and New Zealand. He has directed 15 doctoral students and 37 scientific fellowship holders at IANIGLA, several of whom now work as internationally respected independent scientists at IANIGLA or at other research institutions in Argentina. Although most of these early-career researchers have been Argentinean, Dr. Villalba has also had profound influences on visiting young scientists from Chile, Bolivia, USA, Germany, France, Switzerland, Canada and other countries who have worked with him at IANIGLA. Over the last 20 years, Dr. Villalba has formed an exceptional research team of young and early-career scientists al IANIGLA who have been motivated by and benefited from the exceptional enthusiasm and high standards characteristic of Dr. Villalba's collaborative work.
- <sup>3</sup> Dr. Villaba's research and scientific contributions have earned him extraordinary international and national recognition. Because of his profound contributions in climate science, Dr. Villalba was elected to be a member of the Steering Committee of the leading international paleoclimate research program, PAGES (Past Global Changes) of the International Geosphere and Biosphere Program (IGBP of UNESCO). In addition to his recognition as a corecipient of the Nobel Peace Prize in 2007, Dr. Villalba's meritorious awards and honors include: Mention of Honor of Scientific Merit, granted by the Honorable Deliberating Council of San Rafael, Argentina (December 2007); the Legislative Distinction of the Honorable Senate of the Province of Mendoza (October 2007); Recognition for Scientific Achievement awarded by the Honorable Chamber of Deputies of the Province of Mendoza (April 2008); appointment as Outstanding Personality of the Province of Mendoza in April 2008; and the Tree-Ring Society "Harold C. Fritts Award" for Lifetime Achievement in Dendrochronology (April 2016).

# **SIGNATORIES**

# 1. Dr. Kathryn Allen

Department of Forest and Ecosystem Science University of Melbourne AUSTRALIA

### 2. Dr. Kevin Anchukaitis

Laboratory of Tree Ring Research University of Arizona USA

## 3. **Dr. David Andison**

University of British Columbia Faculty of Forestry Vancouver CANADA

## 4. Dr. Juan Carlos Aravena

Director

Programas Antárticos & Subantárticos Universidad de Magallanes CHILF

### 5. Dr. Jodi N. Axelson

Dept. of Environmental Science, Policy and Management University of California Berkeley CA USA

# 6. **Dr. Patrick Baker**

School of Ecosystem and Forest Sciences University of Melbourne AUSTRALIA

### 7. Dr. Olga Barbosa

Laboratorio de Sustentabilidad Urbana y Cambio Global Instituto de Ciencias Ambientales y Evolutivas Facultad de Ciencias Universidad Austral de Chile CHILE

## 8. **Dr. Ana Bastos**

l'Institut Pierre-Simon-Laplace LSCE FRANCE

# 9. Dr. Soumaya Belmecheri

Laboratory of Tree-Ring Research University of Arizona USA

### 10. Dr. Julio Betancourt

U.S. Geological Survey USA

#### 11. Dr. Etienne Berthier

**CNRS** 

Laboratoire d'Etudes en Géophysique et Océanographie Spatiales Equipe Cryospehere Satellitaire FRANCE

# 12. **Dr. Christof Bigler**

Senior Scientist ETH Zurich SWITZERLAND

### 13. Dr. Bryan A. Black

Marine Science Institute University of Texas at Austin USA

#### 14. Dr. David Bowman

School of Biological Sciences The University of Tasmania AUSTRALIA

## 15. **MSc. Francisca Bown**

Laboratorio de Glaciología Centro de Estudios Científicos CECs CHILE

### 16. Dr. Raymond Bradley

Distinguished Professor University of Massachusetts Amherst, Massachusetts USA

### 17. Dr(c) Claudio Bravo

School of Geography University of Leeds UK

## 18. **Dr. Jefferson Cardia Simões**

Director Instituto Nacional de Ciência e Tecnologia da Criosfera BRAZIL

#### 19. Dr. Matthieu Carré

**CNRS** 

Laboratoire d' Océanographie et du Climat LOCEAN FRANCE

#### 20. Dr. José A. Carreira De La Fuente

Universidad de Jaén SPAIN

#### 21. Dr. Duncan Christie

Director

Instituto de Conservación Biodiversidad y Territorio

Facultad de Cs. Forestales y Recursos Naturales

Universidad Austral de Chile CHILE

### 22. Dr. Edward Cook

Ewing Lamont Research Professor and Director

Tree-Ring Laboratory Lamont-Doherty Earth Observatory of Columbia University Palisades, New York USA

# 23. **Dr. Joaquín Cortés**

Departamento Ciencias de la Tierra Universidad de Concepción CHILE

#### 24. Dr. Lori D. Daniels

Faculty of Forestry
The University of British Columbia
Vancouver
CANADA

### 25. Dr. Rosanne D'Arrigo

Associate Director
Biology and Paleoenvironment Division
Tree-Ring Lab
Lamont-Doherty Earth Observatory
Columbia University
USA

### 26. Dr. Valérie Daux

Laboratoire des Sciences du Climat et de l'Environnement Université Versailles Saint-Quentin en Yvelines FRANCE

# 27. Dr. María Eugenia de Porras

Centro de Estudios Avanzados en Zonas Aridas La Serena CHILE

### 28. **Dr. Henry Diaz**

Fellow of the American Meteorological Society University of Hawai'i at Mānoa Honolulu USA

#### 29. **Dr. Ivan Díaz**

Instituto de Conservación Biodiversidad y Territorio Facultad de Cs. Forestales y Recursos Naturales Universidad Austral de Chile CHILE

## 30. Dr. Igor Drobyshev

Director Institut de Recherche sur les Forêts Université du Québec Canada

## 31. Dr. Alfonso Encinas

Departamento Ciencias de la Tierra Universidad de Concepción CHILE

## 32. Dr. Neal J. Enright

Dean of Graduate Studies Murdoch University AUSTRALIA

## 33. Dr. Jan Esper

Department of Geography
Johannes Gutenberg University
GERMANY

## 34. Dr. Alex Fajardo

Centro de Investigación en Ecosistemas de la Patagonia CHILE

### 35. Dr. Donald A. Falk

School of Natural Resources and the Environment Laboratory of Tree-Ring Research University of Arizona USA

## 36. Dr. Alfonso Fernández

Departamento de Geografía Universidad de Concepción CHILE

#### 37. Dr(c) Fernando Franchetti

Department of Anthropology University of Pittsburgh USA

#### 38. Dr. Jean Pierre François

Departamento de Ciencias Geográficas Facultad de Ciencias Naturales y Exactas Universidad de Playa Ancha CHILE

#### 39. **Dr. David Frank**

Director Laboratory of Tree-Ring Research University of Arizona

USA

#### 40. Dr. Shawn Fraver

School of Forest Resources University of Maine USA

# 41. Dr(c) Cristián Frêne

LTSER

Instituto de Ecología y Biodiversidad Chile

### 42. **Dr. Sherilyn Fritz**

Department of Earth and Atmospheric Sciences University of Nebraska USA

## 43. Dr(c) Mauricio Fuentes

Department of Earth Sciences University of Gothenburg SWEDEN

### 44. Dr. Juan Luis García

Director
Centro UC Desierto de Atacama
Instituto De Geografia
Pontificia Universidad Católica de Chile

# 45. **Dr. Guillermo Gea-Izquierdo**

INIA CIFOR SPAIN

CHILE

## 46. Dr. Ze'ev Gedalof

Climate and Ecosystem Dynamics Research Laboratory Department of Geography University of Guelph CANADA

### 47. Dr. Fabio Gennaretti

INRA Centre Grand Est – Nancy Ecologie et Ecophysiologie Forestières FRANCE

#### 48. Dr. Roberto Godov

Instituto de Ciencias Ambientales y Evolutivas Facultad de Ciencias Universidad Austral de Chile CHILE

## 49. **Dr(c) Álvaro González**

Instituto de Ciencias de la Tierra Facultad de Ciencias Universidad Austral de Chile CHILE

#### 50. **Dr. Mauro González**

Instituto de Conservación Biodiversidad y Territorio Facultad de Cs. Forestales y Recursos Naturales Universidad Austral de Chile CHILE

### 51. Dr. Lisa Graumlich

Mary Laird Professor and Dean College of the Environment University of Washington USA

## 52. Dr. Daniel Griffin

Department of Geography, Environment and Society University of Minnesota USA

# 53. Dr. Martin Grosejan

Director
Oeschger Centre for Climate Change
Research
University of Bern
SWITZERLAND

#### 54. Dr. Joel Guiot

Director of Research CNRS Geosciences of Environment FRANCE

#### 55. **Dr. Álvaro G. Gutiérrez**

Departamento de Ciencias Ambientales y Recursos Naturales Renovables Facultad de Ciencias Agronómicas Universidad de Chile CHILE

# 56. **Dr. Simon Haberle**

Director School of Culture, History and Language The Australian National University AUSTRALIA

### 57. Dr. Philip E. Higuera

Dept. of Ecosystem and Conservation Sciences

University of Montana U.S.A

#### 58. Dr. Katherine K Hirschboeck

Emerita Associate Professor of Climatology Laboratory of Tree-Ring Research The University of Arizona USA

# 59. Dr. Regine Hock

Geophysical Institute University of Alaska USA

## 60. Dr. Andrés Holz

Department of Geography School of the Environment Faculty Fellow, Institute for Sustainable Solutions Portland State University USA

## 61. Dr. Malcolm K. Hughes

Regents' Professor of Dendrochronology Laboratory of Tree-Ring Research University of Arizona USA

# 62. **Dr. Virginia Iglesias**

Earth Lab University of Colorado USA

### 63. Prof. John Innes

Dean
Faculty of Forestry
University of British Columbia
CANADA

## 64. Dr. Mylthon Jimenez-Castillo

Instituto de Ciencias Ambientales y Evolutivas Facultad de Ciencias Universidad Austral de Chile CHILE

### 65. Dr. Philip Jones

Climatic Research Unit School of Environmental Sciences University of East Anglia Norwich UK

# 66. **Dr. Georg Kaser**

Dean
Faculty for Geo- and Atmospheric
Sciences

Institute of Atmospheric and Cryospheric Sciences ACINN University of Innsbruck AUSTRIA

### 67. Dr. Peter Kershaw

Emeritus Professor School of Earth, Atmosphere and Environment Faculty of Science Monash University AUSTRALIA

### 68. Dr. Stefan Klesse

Laboratory of Tree-Ring Research University of Arizona Tucson, Arizona USA

#### 69. Dr. Paul J. Krusic

Deptartment of Geography University of Cambridge UK

## 70. Dr. Antonio Lara

Instituto de Conservación Biodiversidad y Territorio Facultad de Cs. Forestales y Recursos Naturales Universidad Austral de Chile CHILE

# 71. Dr. Guillaume Leduc

CNRS – CEREGE
Europole Mediterraneen de l'Arbois
FRANCE

### 72. Dr. Aliénor Lavergne

Biology Department Silwood Park Campus Imperial College London UK

### 73. **Dr. Carlos LeQuesne**

Instituto de Conservación Biodiversidad y Territorio Facultad de Cs. Forestales y Recursos Naturales Universidad Austral de Chile CHILE

# 74. **Dr. Ken Lertzman**

School of Resource & Environmental Management Faculty of Environment Simon Fraser University Burnaby, British Columbia CANADA

#### 75. **Dr. Jinbao Li**

Department of Geography
The University of Hong Kong
HONG KONG

## 76. Dr. Brian H. Luckman

Emeritus Professor of Geography University of Western Ontario London CANADA

#### 77. Dr. Chris Lusk

Environmental Research Institute University of Waikato NEW ZEALAND

### 78. Dr. Andrew N. Mackintosh

Secretary General
International Association of Cryospheric
Sciences
Director
Antarctic Research Centre
School of Geography, Environment and
Earth Sciences
University of Wellington
NEW ZEALAND

#### 79. **Dr. Antonio Maldonado**

Centro de Estudios Avanzados en Zonas Áridas La Serena CHILE

#### 80. Dr. Katie Manning

Senior Research Associate Department of Gepgraphy King's College London UK

## 81. **Dr. Bryan G. Mark**

State Climatologist of Ohio Byrd Polar and Climate Research Center Ohio State University USA

## 82. Dr. Vera Markgraf

Emeritus Professor University of Colorado Boulder, Colorado USA

# 83. Dr. Valérie Masson-Delmotte

Co-chair of IPCC Senior scientist IPSL/LSCE FRANCE

# 84. **Dr. Dave McWethy**

Assistant Professor Department of Earth Sciences Montana State University USA

### 85. Dr. César Méndez

Centro de Investigación en Ecosistemas de la Patagonia CHILE

#### 86. **Dr. Peter Mitchell**

School of Archaeology University of Oxford UK

## 87. Dr. Aldo Montecionos

Departmento de Geofísica Facultad de Ciencias Físicas y Matemáticas Universidad de Concepción CHILE

## 88. Dr. Ariel Muñoz

Instituto de Geografía Pontificia Universidad Católica de Valparaíso CHILE

# 89. Dr. Cameron E. Naficy

University of British Columbia CANADA

# 90. **Dr. Raphael Neukom**

Geographisches Institut Universität Bern SWITZERLAND

# 91. Dr. Amalia Nuevo Delaunay

Investigadora Residente Centro de Investigación en Ecosistemas de la Patagonia CHILE

## 92. Dr. Clémentine Ols

Laboratoire d'Inventaire Forestier Institut National de l'Information Géographique et Forestière FRANCE

# 93. Dr. Jayson Orton

Department of Archaeology University of South Africa SOUTH AFRICA

### 94. Dr. Jonathan T. Overpeck

Samuel A. Graham Dean School for Environment and

Sustainability University of Michigan USA

## 95. **Dr. Jonathan Palmer**

Research Fellow School of Biological, Earth and Environmental Sciences University of New South Wales AUSTRALIA

#### 96. Dr. Charlotte Pearson

Laboratory of Tree-Ring Research University of Arizona USA

# 97. Dr. Gregory T. Pederson

U.S. Geological Survey USA

### 98. Dr. María Paz Peña

Instituto de Conservación Biodiversidad y Territorio Facultad de Cs. Forestales y Recursos Naturales Universidad Austral de Chile, Valdivia CHILE

## 99. Dr. Alfredo Prieto

Centro Universitario Puerto Natales Universidad de Magallanes CHILE

### 100. Dr. Andrés Rivera

Laboratorio de Glaciología Centro de Estudios Científicos CECs CHILE

### 101. Dr. Maisa Rojas

Departamento de Geofísica Facultad de Ciencias Físicas y Matemáticas Universidad de Chile CHILE

# 102. Dr. Fernando Ruiz Peyré

Institute of Geography University of Innsbruck AUSTRIA

### 103. Dr. Graciela M. Rusch

Norwegian Institute for Nature Research NINA NORWAY

### 104. Dr. Dave Sauchyn

Prairie Adaptation Research Collaborative

Geography and Environmental Studies University of Regina CANADA

## 105. Dr. Christopher A. Scott

Director and Research Professor Udall Center for Studies in Public Policy Professor, School of Geography & Development, and University Distinguished Scholar University of Arizona USA

## 106. Dr. María Eugenia Solari

Instituto de Estudios Antroplógicos Universidad Austral de Chile, CHILE

# 107. **Dr. Olga Solomina**

Director of the Institute of Geography Moscow Corresponding Member of Russian Academy of Sciences RUSSIA

# 108. Dr. Rosemary Sherriff

Geography Department Humboldt State University USA

### 109. Dr. Margit Schwikowski

Head of the Environmental Chemistry Laboratory Paul Scherrer Institute SWITZERLAND

## 110. Dr. Francisco A. Squeo

Universidad de La Serena Institute of Ecology & Biodiversity CHILE

## 111. Dr. Richard Seager

Lamont Research Professor Columbia University USA

#### 112. Dr. Jason S. Sibold

Department of Anthropology Colorado State University USA

## 113. Dr. Jason E. Smerdon

Lamont Research Professor Columbia University USA

# 114. Dr. Markus Stoffel

Department of Physics & Department of

Earth and Environmental Sciences University of Geneva SWITZERLAND

### 115. Dr. Thomas W. Swetnam

Regents' Professor, Emeritus Laboratory of Tree-Ring Research University of Arizona Tucson, Arizona USA

### 116. Dr. Paul Szejner

Laboratory of Tree-Ring Research University of Arizona Tucson, Arizona USA

## 117. Dr. Lonnie G. Thompson

Distinguished University Professor The Ohio State University Columbus, Ohio USA

## 118. Dr. David Thomas

School of Geography and the Environment University of Oxford UK

### 119. Dr. Ronald H. Towner

Laboratory of Tree-Ring Research University of Arizona USA

#### 120. Dr. Valerie Trouet

Laboratory of Tree-Ring Research University of Arizona Tucson, Arizona USA

## 121. Dr. Rocío Urrutia

Instituto de Conservación Biodiversidad y Territorio Facultad de Cs. Forestales y Recursos Naturales Universidad Austral de Chile, Valdivia CHILE

# 122. Dr. Daniela Valenzuela

Departamento de Antropología Universidad de Tarapacá CHILE

#### 123. Dr. Thomas T. Veblen

Distinguished Professor Department of Geography University of Colorado Boulder, Colorado USA

## 124. Dr. José Villanueva

Centro Nacional de Investigación Disciplinaria en Relación Agua-Suelo-Planta-Atmósfera INIFAP CENID-RASPA MEXICO

#### 125. Dr. Lucien von Gunten

Science Officer
PAGES - Past Global Changes
SWITZERLAND

#### 126. Dr. Mathias Vuille

Department of Atmospheric and Environmental Sciences University at Albany, SUNY USA

#### 127. Dr. Heinz Wanner

Oeschger-Centre for Climate Change Research University of Bern SWITZERLAND

### 128. **Dr. Cathy Whitlock**

Montana Institute on Ecosystems Montana State University USA

## 129. Dr. Gregory C. Wiles

Department of Geology The College of Wooster USA

#### 130. Dr. Park Williams

Lamont-Doherty Earth Observatory Columbia University USA

#### 131. Dr. Connie Woodhouse

School of Geography and Development University of Arizona USA

## 132. Dr. Bernd Zolitschka

University of Bremen GERMANY